

## Case Analysis b

Criteria	Content/Development	Ratings	Pts
<p>Paper was excellent, had few to no errors, and covered all key elements of the assignment. The content was well understood by the reader and covered the topics discussed in class. Major points were supported by insightful facts and the writer went beyond textbook and classroom discussion.</p> <p>35.0 pts</p>	<p>Paper was well written, had some minor errors, and covered most elements of the assignment. The content was well understood by the reader and covered the topics discussed in class. Major points were supported by information covered in class and materials from the course.</p> <p>29.75 pts</p>	<p>The paper provided made good effort but there were areas of opportunity throughout. Grammatically there were consistent errors or the elements covered did not have a consistent theme or flow. Major points of the assignment were either overlooked or not well supported.</p> <p>26.25 pts</p> <p>22.75 pts</p> <p>19.25 pts</p>	<p>The paper provided made good effort but there were a consistent number of errors throughout. There were significant concerns with grammar and structure and the writer was unable to develop a strong theme for the paper that was strongly connected to the course. Major points of the assignment were weak or not well supported.</p> <p>19.25 pts</p> <p>19.25 pts</p> <p>19.25 pts</p> <p>35.0 pts</p>
<p>The introduction of the paper clearly stated the topic and intent of the writer in a succinct manner. The author created a strong central theme for the paper with a clear, logical, and easy to follow structure. The paper was well supported with insight and information relevant to the topic with a strong conclusion or recommendation that flowed logically from the body of the paper.</p> <p>7.5 pts</p>	<p>The introduction of the paper was well stated and the overall paper remained on topic. The author created a theme for the paper that was clear and logical. The paper had relevant information related to the major topics of the class and had a sensible conclusion.</p> <p>6.38 pts</p> <p>5.63 pts</p> <p>4.88 pts</p>	<p>The introduction of the paper could have used improvement to better frame the topic for the reader. Though a theme was present, it was sometimes difficult for the reader to follow. The information of the paper was relevant to the material of the class. The conclusion either needed work or did not flow in context to the rest of the paper.</p> <p>4.13 pts</p>	<p>No Paper Submitted 0.0 pts</p>
<p>Organization</p>			<p>7.5 pts</p>

Criteria	Formatting aligned to expectations. References or citations to information were properly formatted and headers or other reader friendly formatting made the paper easy to move through. The writers overall style is neat and flows well. Rules of grammar, word usage, punctuation, and spelling were strong and well aligned with expectations. Sentences were complete, clear, concise, and well-constructed. Writing transitions were smooth and thought was paid to flow and comprehension. Word usage was aligned with expectations without ambiguity. Overall tone was strong and relevant to the content of the assignment.	Formatting aligned to writing expectations for DVC. References or citations were not used or were not formatted correctly. Formatting of the paper was present and identifiable. The style was on par with expectations. Rules of grammar, word usage, punctuation, and spelling were on par with expectations and had few errors. Sentences were complete and clear.	Though formatting was present, there was an opportunity to make improvements in some areas. The author used few if any references or citations and or did not format them well. The overall paper formatting was difficult to identify as the reader struggled to identify the writers style consistent with what is expected for DVC students.	Though formatting was present, there was an opportunity to make improvements in some areas. The author used no references or citations and or did not format them well. The overall paper formatting was difficult to identify as the reader struggled to identify the writers style consistent with what is expected for DVC students.	The paper did not seem to have a formal or theme consistent with expectations. The author used no references or citations and the overall flow of the paper references or citations and or did not format them well. The overall paper formatting was challenging for the reader showing an opportunity to focus on improvement. There were consistent issues throughout the paper with rules of punctuation, and or spelling have opportunities for improvement. Sentences and or writing transitions were on par with expectations and could be followed by the reader. Word usage was aligned with expectations with little to no ambiguity. Overall tone was aligned with expectations.	No Paper Submitted 0.0 pts	Pts
Ratings							
Style/Mechanics							
Total Points: 50.0							7.5 pts

## INCIDENT 1 These Things Are a Pain

"There, at last it's finished," thought Rajiv Chaudhry, as he laid aside the last of 12 PA forms. It had been a busy week for Rajiv, who supervises a road maintenance crew for the Georgia Department of Highways.

In passing through Rajiv's district a few days previously, the governor had complained to the area superintendent that repairs were needed on several of the highways. Because of this, the superintendent assigned Rajiv's crew an unusually heavy workload. In addition, Rajiv received a call from the HR office that week reminding him that the PAs were late. Rajiv explained his predicament, but the HR specialist insisted that the forms be completed right away.

Looking over the appraisals again, Rajiv thought about several of the workers. The PA form had places for marking *quantity of work*, *quality of work*, and *cooperativeness*. For each characteristic, the worker could be graded *outstanding*, *good*, *average*, *below average*, or *unsatisfactory*. As Rajiv's crew had completed all of the extra work assigned for that week, he marked every worker *outstanding* in *quantity of work*. He marked Joe Blum *average* in *cooperativeness* because Joe had questioned one of his decisions that week. Rajiv had decided to patch a pothole in one of the roads, and Joe thought the small section of road surface ought to be broken out and replaced. Rajiv didn't include this in the remarks section of the form, though. As a matter of fact, he wrote no remarks on any of the forms.

Rajiv felt a twinge of guilt as he thought about Roger Short. He knew that Roger had been goofing off, and the other workers had been carrying him for quite some time. He also knew that Roger would be upset if he found that he had been marked lower than the other workers. Consequently, he marked Roger the same to avoid a confrontation. "Anyway," Rajiv thought, "these things are a pain, and I really shouldn't have to bother with them."

As Rajiv folded up the PAs and put them in the envelope for mailing, he smiled. He was glad he would not have to think about PAs for another six months.

### Questions

- 7-15. What weaknesses do you see in Rajiv's performance appraisals?
- 7-16. Should HR have the ability to "insist that the forms be completed right away"? Discuss.
- 7-17. Many managers would agree with Rajiv in saying that "these things are a pain, and I really shouldn't have to bother with them." What are the disadvantages in doing away with performance appraisal?

## INCIDENT 2 Performance Appraisal?

As the production supervisor for Sweeny Electronics, Nakeisha Joseph was generally well regarded by most of her subordinates. Nakeisha was an easygoing individual who tried to help her employees in any way she could. If a worker needed a small loan until payday, she would dig into her pocket with no questions asked. Should an employee need some time off to attend to a personal problem, Nakeisha would not dock the individual's pay; rather, she would take up the slack herself until the worker returned.

Everything had been going smoothly, at least until the last PA period. One of Nakeisha's workers, Bill Overstreet, had been experiencing a large number of personal problems for the past year. Bill's wife had been sick much of the time, and her medical expenses were high. Bill's son had a speech impediment, and the doctors had recommended a special clinic. Bill, who had already borrowed the limit the bank would loan, had become upset and despondent over his circumstances.

When it was time for Bill's annual PA, Nakeisha decided she was going to do as much as possible to help him. Although Bill could not

be considered more than an average worker, Nakeisha rated him outstanding in virtually every category. Because the firm's compensation system was heavily tied to PA, Bill would be eligible for a merit increase of 10 percent in addition to a regular cost-of-living raise.

Nakeisha explained to Bill why she was giving him such high ratings, and Bill acknowledged that his performance had really been no better than average. Bill was very grateful and expressed this to Nakeisha. As Bill left the office, he was excitedly looking forward to telling his work buddies about what a wonderful boss he had. Seeing Bill smile as he left gave Nakeisha a warm feeling.

### Questions

- 7-18. From Sweeny Electronics' standpoint, what difficulties might Nakeisha's PA practices create?
- 7-19. What can Nakeisha do now to diminish the negative impact of her evaluation of Bill?
- 7-20. Might a forced distribution performance appraisal system overcome the problem that Nakeisha has created? Discuss.